australian ~ canadian studies

- a journal for the humanities & the social sciences -

vol. 8, no. 1
1990

table of contents

Editorial 1

Feature Articles

Shirley Neuman	(Re)reading Nineteenth Century Women Authors: Critical Approaches	5
Gary Boire	Inside Out: Prison Theatre from Australia, Canada, and New Zealand	21
Robert Wilson	Playpens for Leviathan: Canadian Uses of 'Postmodern'	35
Jeremy Mouat	The Miners of Broken Hill, Waihi and Rossland: A Comparative Investigation	47
Donald R. Beer	Responsible Government in the 1980s: A Survey of Recent Literature of the Introduction of Colonial Self-Government	75

Review Essays

Donald DeBats	The Study of Region: A Canadian Example from the Prairies	95
John Wanna	Policy-Making for Canadian Business	103

Taking Issue

Gillian Whitlock	Unreliable Citizens: Gender, Nation, Interpretation	109

In Review 119

Notes on Contributors 133

in review

J. Rodney Millard, *The Master Spirit of the Age. Canadian Engineers and the Politics of Professionalism* — David de Guistino

Veronica Strong-Boag, *The New Day Recalled. Lives of Girls and Women in English Canada, 1919-1939* — Gail Reekie

William Westfall, *Two Worlds: The Protestant Culture of Nineteenth-Century Ontario* — David de Guistino

R. Quinn Duffy, *The Road to Nunavut* — John Tyman

Leslie Pal, *State Class and Bureaucracy: Canadian Unemployment Insurance and Public Policy* — Paul Chantrill

J. Rodney Millard, *The Master Spirit of the Age: Canadian Engineers and the Politics of Professionalism*, **Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1988.**

It is sometimes said that Canada is a country made for engineers and then remade by them. The cold climate, the innumerable lakes and marshes, the formidable Rockies, and above all the great distances have all become the playthings of engineers in their struggle to make Canada a comfortable First World country. But geography and climate have been only the most obvious aspects of the engineer's struggle. As J.R. Millard has shown in *Spirit of the Age*, Canadian engineers have also confronted obstacles in their quest for social prestige and professional development.

The 'Age' which Millard examines is brief. It extends from the late 1880s (with the inauguration of the Canadian Society of Civil Engineers in 1887 as a major event) to the early 1920s (when laws for the formal registration of engineers came into effect). During this single generation, all Canadians saw the consolidation of the country's political identity, an increasing reliance on tertiary education, the general use of electricity, the emergence of a new road system to serve the motorcar, and the impact of the Great War on the economic organisation of the country. Moreover, as Millard reminds us (p.11), these same years witnessed Canada's 'transformation from a rural agrarian country to an urban industrial nation', in which engineers became the 'vanguard of the new middle class'. The 'age' was undeniably crucial to the formation of national consciousness and the identification of modern professions.

Indeed, national and professional consciousness were inseparable parts of the story. As Millard demonstrates in his fourth chapter, the 'special native expertise' of Canadian engineers did not always guarantee them jobs. While as many as one-third of them were out of Canada fighting the Great War, important Canadian contracts went to American architects and engineers (p.60). Even before 1914, Canadian engineers felt 'humiliated and stigmatized': their education, their salaries and their professional reputation never seemed to match conditions south of the border. As usual, the 'long, friendly and undefended border' was a problem. The Canadians lured to the States by the prospect of better jobs and salaries tended to stay there; they became citizens and 'participated fully in the civil and professional life of their adopted country' (p.61). There was no compensation for their loss, as American engineers stayed in Canada 'only for the job' and then departed with their accumulated savings. Millard does not believe that these developments led to anti-Americanism as such, although he does refer to those engineers (particularly in the West) who became more vocal in demanding that municipal and provincial governments employ Canadians.

Professional consciousness also involved politics. At a time of *laissez-faire*

attitudes, few professions enjoyed statutory authority to regulate themselves. The Canadian Society of Civil Engineers (CSCE) spent most of the 1880s and 1890s agitating for laws which should make them a 'closed corporation' with powers to admit, certify and discipline all those who wished to be civil engineers. Their long campaign was plagued by regional tensions (the leading engineers in Montreal were never very co-operative) and by the hostility of mining and other non-civil engineers, who were suspicious of the CSCE's ambitions. The first success in closing the profession to 'unqualified' persons occurred at provincial level, with Manitoba leading the way in 1896. Other engineers embarked on similar campaigns, but had to wait another generation for comprehensive national laws. There was no professional unity about the urgency of legislation. Some engineers objected to the idea because they did not see themselves as 'mechanics' who needed the sort of legislation which guided trade unions. At the same time, non-engineers (and many politicians) were reluctant about legislation and pointed to the United States and Great Britain, where engineering was an 'open profession'. They argued that engineers were *not* like lawyers and doctors, who might easily take advantage of naive citizens; the governments and large companies which employed engineers would insure their proper behaviour and high standards (p.73).

Social esteem proved more elusive than statutory recognition. According to Millard, the nomadic existence of engineers in a huge, sparsely-populated country meant that they were 'not a clearly defined and cohesive group' (p.86). Too often, they were strangers to each other and to the public they served. It is not surprising, therefore, that some Canadian engineers sought social recognition by becoming more mindful of society's problems: altruism and social activism would help them transcend their old reputation as mere 'tradesmen'. Of course this aspiration was not shared by the whole of the CSCE, many of whom saw their profession as an elite learned society. The social activists would not have their way until they managed to reform the CSCE itself. This they did by enlisting the support of younger, civic-minded engineers in central and western Canada and resisting the conservative attitudes which Millard associates with 'the Montreal clique'.

The biggest problem was not regional but the issue of 'unionism'. Many engineers (on both sides of the border) considered themselves a class above trade-unionists, and they wanted no part of any organisation or society which borrowed from the language, tactics or sentiments of the unions. The opposite view, long a minority opinion, assumed that all engineers shared a common interest with (as C.A. Muller put it) 'those who *work* in industry, and not those who *own* industry'. The anti-union mentality was slow to change, and Millard argues that it was only after the first World War that engineers, confronting the erratic economies of boom and depression, realised that they were 'at the mercy of unsympathetic employers' who worried no more about the professional training and reputation of engineers than they did the working conditions of 'ordinary mechanics' (p.112).

In many ways, *The Master Spirit of the Age* is an impressive work. It brings together a great deal of material which has never been correlated before. As the endnotes reveal, the study makes good use of long-neglected papers, memoirs and records. Indeed, the University of Toronto Press must be complemented not only for the quality of presentation but also for their generosity in allowing over one-third of this book to be devoted to extensive and legible notes. Admittedly, the professional consciousness of Canadian engineers is not a subject likely to grip a large readership. On the other hand, all historians should be pleased that Millard's efforts have extended the boundaries of what we know as 'social history'. *The Master Spirit of the Age* opens our eyes not simply to a modern profession but to the necessity of doing similarly detailed studies of other groups in many other countries.

David de Guistino
Griffith University

Veronica Strong-Boag, *The New Day Recalled. Lives of Girls and Women in English Canada, 191-1939*, **Markham, Ontario: Penguin, 1988.**

In her discussion of Canadian women's responses to marriage in the inter-war period, Veronica Strong-Boag writes that a woman considered herself fortunate when

> despite years of suffering and drudgery, a normally inarticulate husband could yell from his labours with the cows across to her as she emptied the wash tub: 'I kinds [sic] like you. Thought I'd tell you. I just happened to think of it!'. (p.103)

Strong-Boag's poignant comment on the painful gulf between the romantic heterosexuality presented by movies and magazines and women's ability to make the most of the opportunities for happiness presented to them is a good example of the cautious balance of her account of the English Canadian female experience in the 1920s and 1930s. Strong-Boag's central task is to examine what happened to women and girls after the vote was won. Her pessimistic finding that the promise of the 'new day' for women remained unfulfilled in 1939 is tempered by a historically-sensitive appreciation of women's resourcefulness and strength.

The book is organised not around traditional historical pivots such as war and depression, but according to a women's timetable shaped by lifecycle events: girlhood, paid work, courtship and marriage, keeping house, mothering and old age. The lifecycle approach allows the full extent and multifaceted nature of the female experience to be revealed, yet is sufficiently flexible to accommodate crucial themes such as advertising and consumerism, education, sexual exploitation, feminism and anti-feminism. Placing a discussion of women's

participation in public life and political organisations in the chapter devoted to 'Getting old: forty and beyond' is particularly innovative, although the connections between old age and activism might have been more explicitly theorised.

The book as a whole is uncomplicated by any overt theoretical contextualisation or methodological statements. Strong-Boag refers variously to patriarchy, misogyny, chauvinism, sexual hierarchies and other expressions of sexual inequality, without being specific about her theoretical assumptions other than an introductory comment that class stratification was subordinate to sex. Neither does she place her work in the context of that of other feminist historians. The smooth narrative precludes any questioning of the sources or critical discussion of way in which they have been used. None of this detracts from the status of *The New Day Recalled* as a scholarly, readable and superbly synthesised study of women. It is just that self-reflection, contradiction and debate is missing.

Also missing is a bibliography, which would have provided a useful guide for Australian historians interested in locating Canadian women's history for comparative purposes. However, there is much in this study that is of value to feminists outside Canada. Some of the contrasts - for example, the extensive political organisation of farm women 'Canadianisation', the pervasive hostility to American culture, and the much greater historical significance of ethnic differences - are intriguing. Perhaps more striking are the similarities between Canadian and Australian women's experiences. Strong-Boag's story of the Dione quintuplets and the ways in which mothering became subject to scientific intervention in the 1920s is remarkably similar to Kereen Reiger's account of the 'modernisation' of the Australian family in the same period in *The Disenchantment of the Home* (1985). *The New Day Recalled* provides an insight not just into Canadian women's history, but contributes to a broader understanding of women's historical experience in western cultures.

Gail Reekie
Griffith University

William Westfall, *Two Worlds: The Protestant Culture of nineteenth-Century Ontario*, **Montreal and Kingston, McGill-Queen's University Press, 1989.**

Historians continue to quarry the nineteenth century in the hope of better understanding the various national cultures of Europe and North America. Inevitably perhaps, they have reached almost as many definitions of 'culture' as there are societies to examine. Their studies are engaging but necessarily incomplete, as more and more scholars uncover new seams of historical evidence

and interpret long-known materials in a critical new light.

One would think it is time for digging much deeper into Canada's cultural history. The most obvious aspect of this past is the role of religious sensitivities in the two major components of the dominion which emerges in 1867. Quebec, overwhelmingly French in culture and Roman Catholic in religion, has always proved an uneasy partner with Ontario, decidedly British and Protestant. The tensions of more than a century carry into modern Canadian historiography: so much so, that it is almost too much to expect Canadian historians to treat the two cultures in the same monograph. Upper and Lower Canada still exist in the minds of Canadians.

William Westfall's new book continues in this tradition. His *Two Worlds: The Protestant Culture of Nineteenth-Century Ontario* is, quite literally, a provincial study. Its focus is on a territory which, by the time of Confederation, reached only about half of its present size and less than one-quarter of its present population. Even so, the dimensions of nineteenth-century Ontario do not in themselves account for the many shortcomings of Westfall's book. *Two Worlds* promises much, but the author does not dig deeply or widely enough in a place which is undoubtedly richer than his efforts suggest.

There is, first of all, the concept of culture. What exactly does culture mean in a corner of the British Empire which, for much of the nineteenth century, was located on the very frontier of settlement? Westfall prefers the high ground of definition. His view of culture is one which primarily concerns the respectable and the literate. He has almost nothing to say about the inarticulate Christians or the unlicensed preachers of Upper Canada. The religious beliefs of the fur-trappers, the curious religious amalgams of Indian tribes, the central Europeans who preached in the north, the hostility of francophone communities in Ontario: all these are ignored. Instead, Westfall sees Ontario as a less urbanised version of Britain, and Ontario's religious milieu as the work of relatively polite intellectuals. The debates over ritual and apostolic succession, the historical perspectives of Newman and his Oxford friends, the notions of material (as opposed to spiritual) progress: these concerns of British Protestants certainly exercised the minds of Protestants in Kingston, Toronto and London in Ontario. But there were, in both Britain and Canada, varieties of Protestantism which were less intellectual, less philosophical, and less polite; varieties which fostered jealously, polemics and divisions amongst Christians. Of these, too, we learn nothing in *Two Worlds*.

On the subject of Protestant social activism, Westfall is a little more helpful. He confirms the importance of the great Protestant crusades for Temperance and Sabbath Observance. Here, too, the picture is sketchy. Westfall does not explain the dynamics of these 'crusades' - who led them, where (and how) they were most effective, whether there was any significant co-operation amongst the Protestant churches (as there was in the temperance crusade in the States). There is nothing about the Anti-slavery Crusade and the assistance given to refugee slaves in the first half of the century, and the part played by Ontario women in various social crusades also finds no scope here. Again recalling the nature of Ontario society for so much of the century, we are probably entitled to ask what social and religious crusades really meant to frontier communities, far from Kingston and Toronto.

The author's approach to 'Revivalism' (the subject of chapter 3) is similar. He identifies it virtually as an impulse of Methodism; indeed, the chapter on revivalism is really an excuse for looking at Methodism. Unfortunately, the story is again simplified. There is no allowing for the many factions which called themselves Methodists, and Westfall seems to think the revivalism is the natural, logical outcome of Methodist worship and 'emotional language' (p.56). It may well have been - up to a point, but non-Methodists also participated. Westfall's findings differ very little from what we already know of English revivalism and pietism in the eighteenth-century and his conclusions are rather curious to anyone who half-expects a different development in frontier society.

Still other aspects of Protestant culture appear to have escaped Westfall's attention altogether. There is, for example, nothing about the 'muscular Christianity' which was preached (and enforced) in expensive private schools. The Bible Societies, so busy in the first three decades of the century in Britain and America, receive no comment in *Two Worlds*. Nor do the later disputes between parsons and preachers on the one side and professional scientists and bible critics on the other. The role of scripture-reading in Ontario schools seems miraculously to have generated no political disputes, and the relationship of Ontario Protestantism to the brash, confident values of North American capitalism is a topic which gains only cursory remarks in the last chapter. Religion and 'the new political economy' rates a single paragraph, and the Protestant response to socialism in the 1890s is neglected entirely.

Even the author's definition of the nineteenth century falls short. In fact, the vast bulk of Westfall's material concerns the period from ca. 1825 to ca. 1880. True, the 1830s, 40s and 50s are an extremely formative time in Ontario society: the Durham Report, a stronger sense of nation, the realisation of great agricultural wealth, and moves toward Confederation all occur then. But Protestantism in Ontario? Perhaps it wasn't so different at the opposite ends of the century, and of course centuries and monarchs' reigns are arbitrary periods, anyway. Still, the interplay of religious, economic and political ideas are critical to the formation of any culture, and Westfall is remiss in neglecting the beliefs of capitalism, muscular Christianity and imperialism in the fabric of Ontario Protestantism.

There are some positive features to *Two Worlds*. Generally, the expression is clear and uncomplicated; there are occasional signs of a good humour. 'Epics in Stone' is an interesting chapter for what it reveals of provincial adaptations of British and European architecture. The endnotes are adequate, legibly presented and informative, and they have to be, for there is no separate bibliography. It is also apparent from the endnotes that the author is acquainted with a range of essays, tracts, sermons and memoirs, material usually limited to single editions and practically impossible for the general reader to use. For all that, *Two Worlds*

remains a highly selected assembly of subjects, offering no surprises while it reinforces notions of a religiously tranquil and uncomplicated province.

David de Guistino
Griffith University

R. Quinn Duffy, *The Road to Nunavut,* **Kingston and Montreal, McGill-Queens University Press, 1988, 331pp.**

'Nunavut' means simple 'Our Land' - in the language of that branch of humanity which most of the world still refers to as 'Eskimo'. The book is sub-titled 'The Progress of the Eastern Arctic Inuit since the Second World War'. The word 'Inuit', of course, identified 'The People' - for, ironically, they were once so isolated as to imagine themselves alone on the earth; they now know better and, as is often the case, knowledge has proved to be a mixed blessing.

At first glance, 'progress' seems a strange word to use in speaking of a people who in the space of thirty years experienced spatial dislocation, if not dispossession, together with the progressive destruction of their culture and consequent loss of identity. However, by the end of the book we find them claiming possession of a land which they can again call their own, a land in which they can once more be themselves.

In his preface Duffy establishes the natural and historical contexts of the story which is to follow. He identifies the basic elements of traditional Inuit culture and the motivation of the newcomers who brought about its progressive transformation. First came the whalers, then the fur traders and the missionaries, and finally the administrators who 'destroyed the political independence of the Inuit as surely as trapping and wage labour destroyed their economic independence' (p.xvii). In the space of a single generation 'the traditional Eskimos... (had) been succeeded by the modern Inuit, a new breed sired from the old by the impregnation of southern Canadian culture... The old Eskimos had abandoned their winter camps, their igloos, dog sleds, and soapstone lamps, and disappeared into the long Arctic night. In their place the new Inuit in blue jeans and nylon parkas were living in modern homes with electric lights and television sets and buying groceries at the local supermarket' (p.xxii). Others, broken in spirit, had found comfort in alcohol or escaped by way of suicide.

The book itself, while chronicling the passing of nomadism and subsistence hunting, actually focuses on the role of the government, a reluctant guardian to begin with but a conscientious, albeit patronising and unimaginative, parent thereafter. The material is arranged by topic, with chapters on 'Supplying Shelter', 'Looking after Health', 'Providing an Education', 'Providing a Living' and 'Relinquishing Authority'. Within each chapter the treatment is chronological, and this involves a certain amount of repetition - in consequence of which the reader

wonders from time to time when he/she read that before. But a degree of overlap is not only inevitable but desirable to tie things together; and this the author does very well. The whole thing is cunningly constructed (it resembles a detective story in places, so carefully are the elements of the plot interwoven). It is also a work of impressive scholarship, based on a painstaking study of the literature (so immense a task that it can only have been a labour of love). And it is carefully documented (though, being lazy, there were times when I could have appreciated a straightforward bibliography of published works).

Though the amount of information presented is impressive in itself (and may be some chapters were a trifle long) the book is eminently readable throughout. it also offers an interesting admixture of styles - generally 'academic' but often journalistic and sometimes poetic. I confess, too, that it is a book which stretched and expanded my vocabulary.

From such a storehouse of information and incisive comment it is difficult, and may be even dangerous, to single out particular passages. But for students investigating parallels between the experiences of the Inuit and those of aboriginal peoples elsewhere, the following should be of particular interest:

> The appearance of outpost camps in the mid-1970s made Southern Canadians, and even the Inuit themselves, aware that not all Inuit were susceptible to the blandishments of organized communities. Some were determined to preserve their own culture, language and independence. Many of these Inuit believed that the only way to restore the integrity of their natural communities was to return to traditional ways of life on the land and the sea-edge. They wanted to have nothing more to do with the competitiveness, aggression, and alcoholism that were major ingredients of what the white men called civilized life (p.187).

> Traditional pursuits... are still a powerful force in Inuit culture and potent symbols of Inuit identity, unity, and uniqueness. Hunting, fishing, and trapping... are more than just ways to earn a living. They return the Inuit to those older ways of life in which the land, the sea, and the wild animals take up again a central place in native religion. Hunting, fishing and trapping thus reaffirm the Inuit's place in the spiritual world and link them with their ancestors who lived on the land before (them)... Wage employment cannot provide such deeply rooted satisfaction (p.194).

> Inuit view their... use of the seas and the land as a fundamental right that is woven into the fabric of their lives. They view their environment and their own place in it as an indivisible entity. The inability of outsiders to grasp the Inuit perception of their own world is at the root of most of the present conflicts (p.260).

This is why the move to establish Nunavut, or at the very least to return to the Inuit control over long-established hunting territories and a strong voice in the development of the remainder, is so important.

Australian scholars are reminded from time to time of the gulf which separates their government's fiction that Australia was unoccupied in 1788 *terra nullis* from Canada's long-standing acknowledgement of the rights of indigenous peoples. They will, sadly, find little evidence of such enlightenment in the book's account of Canada's treatment of the Inuit in earlier decades. From 1973 onwards, though, the Canadian government has repeatedly affirmed its commitment to the

satisfactory resolution of Native land claims 'in all fairness'.

Inevitably *The Road to Nunavut* provides no information on the series of agreements reached in the last two or three years. Hopefully its author will consider writing another volume following the ratification of the many agreements reached in principle. I must admit, too, that there were times when (as one whose interests have hitherto been focused on the Central and Western Arctic) I found the author's pre-occupation with Baffin Island a little frustrating. It prompted generalisations which were not always applicable elsewhere. However, I shall ever remain in his debt for his careful exposition of the policy and practice basic to any attempt to understand the contemporary scene.

This is an important book, even a precious one; for the story it tells, while directed to the development of an informed understanding, also evokes feelings - of sadness, anger and despair or of inspiration, determination and commitment, depending on the chapter you are reading and on your own state of (heart and) mind. Above all it is a relevant book- not only to the people of Canada but also in Australia. In fact it should be required reading anywhere and everywhere the survival of indigenous peoples is threatened - and the once rich fabric of humanity is faced with further impoverishment.

For forty years or more it has been common for 'intrepid' visitors from the South to imagine that they are indeed the last to experience 'true Inuit culture'; and several of Duffy's sources lean in this direction. This probably indicates a narrow definition of the essence of a culture, but I suspect it is also a reflection of our own cultural impoverishment. Having in our society few practices and values we consider non-negotiable, we have unthinkingly sold ourselves to the highest bidder in our search for higher and higher living standards: and we assume that everyone else is the same - the Inuit included! But cultures are never set in stone, save perhaps when they are buried. They evolve, and those things (if any) which a people really value will somehow be retained.

The Inuit, after all, are 'survivors par excellence' (p.xviii). And with the impending resolution of the lands question they are entering upon a new era, and a hopeful one. 'With that tenacity of spirit that sustained them through thousands of years in the harshest environment on earth, they are fighting to regain their cultural independence, their self-respect, their identity as a unique people... And they are winning' (p.xviii). Let us hope they succeed, for all our sakes. *The Road to Nunavut* is a significant step in this direction.

John Tyman
Griffith University

Leslie Pal, *State Class and Bureaucracy: Canadian Unemployment Insurance and Public Policy,* **Kingston and Montreal, McGill-Queens University Press, 1988.**

Leslie Pal's account of the development of unemployment insurance in Canada is an important milestone in Canadian literature on public policy. This importance is based on the contribution Pal makes in bridging the gap in the existing literature between general descriptive accounts of the development of social policy and general theoretical works on the determinants of public policy. This is achieved by the book's review of major theoretical approaches in the light of their utility and relevance to the historical record. Analysis of theory, through attention to historical detail, then enables Pal to bring together the somewhat disparate elements of research on Canadian public policy to generate an exceptionally well integrated and unified analysis of Canadian unemployment insurance.

The scope of Pal's analysis is broad. He analyses the relationship between unemployment and the Welfare State and the historical background and development of unemployment policy in Canada with extensive references to overseas experiences and influences. Finally, Pal engages in an exercise of 'theory evaluation and comparison'. This ambitious project succeeds in bringing the varied concerns of public policy researchers into focus for an overall picture of the state of contemporary research. However, one is left with the strong sense that there is still much more that can be done in exploring fruitful connections amongst the various approaches.

Pal sees his book as providing a 'disciplined explanation' of public policy which tests theoretical propositions against the historical record. Clearly, he attempts to assert his own priorities against those of other important works in the field like James Struthers' historical narrative on unemployment policy *No Fault Of Their Own* and Keith Bantings' concern with a critical test case of the role of federalism in *The Welfare State and Canadian Federalism*. Nonetheless, Pal draws many insights from these two influential sources and readers would find his study to be complementary and familiar in theme and scope.

The substance of Pal's analysis features a review of theories that are grouped within the now familiar distinction between 'society' and 'state' centred approaches. This distinction follows a revival of interest in the state and its institutional manifestations as important determinants of public policy outcomes in the works of Krasner, Nordlinger and Skocpol and others. A more critical treatment of the 'society centred' theories of Marxists and pluralists has followed from the rejection of their primary focus on producer group interests and Pal decides that the 'state centred' approaches have the greater utility. In his view, the historical evidence points to more direct and recognisable influences on the substance of policy outcomes from the state bureaucracy, and to a lesser extent, the institutional features of Canada's federal system, than less easily analysed class interests.

According to Pal, the utility of the class politics framework is most likely to be borne out in the case of unemployment insurance. Unemployment is the area of public policy that directly impinges on the opposing interests of labour and capital as both groups have conflicting views on policy priorities. Evidence presented by Pal shows that their formal submissions to government were invariably brief with a narrow issue focus. They were predictable and easily anticipated and had no measurable influence or sway over policy formulation. The broad detail of the complex formulations covering contributions, benefits, duration and coverage remained primarily the concern of government. Consequently, Pal focuses on the state bureaucracy to better illuminate the process of policy formation. However, any questions concerning the possible significance of social unrest and class based agitation external to formal political settings remains largely undeveloped in his analysis. Why unemployment issues emerged with greater or less urgency at different times is, therefore, not adequately resolved in Pal's account.

It is with confidence that Pal turns to the consideration of the role of the state bureaucracy in the determination of policy outcomes in the case of unemployment insurance. In the absence of detailed inputs from labour and capital, the bureaucracy was, in Pal's view, left largely unchallenged. It was free to develop and apply its own organising principles which centred around the promotion of actuarial principles and methods. This involved the development of unemployment insurance as a programme based on strict insurance principles of self-financing and the necessary corollaries of contributions from potential beneficiaries and safeguards against abuse. In the formative period of the unemployment insurance system Pal shows convincingly how the critical aspects of programme organisation including benefits, duration and coverage were strongly bound up with bureaucratic perspectives on administrative feasibility and the sound finance principles represented in the notion of actuarialism.

The final area of theoretical explanation dealt with by Pal is the institutionalist approach to public policy formation. This approach is in itself extremely complex and multi-faceted and consideration of it could involve a whole further study encompassing a focus on the role of political parties, electoral systems, parliamentary procedures, etc. Pal overcomes this problem by selecting federalism as the state institutional form for consideration - a central and long term pre-occupation for Canadian studies of public policy. Pal acknowledges the difficulties of dealing with federalism, the subject of strongly contested views, and suggests that, hitherto, no theorists have been clear on the precise influence of federalism on public policy. Generally treated as either 'structure' or 'process', federalism has been widely held to imply a conservative dynamic for public policy formation since it involves protracted inter-governmental negotiation and complex constitutional and legalistic questions. Federalism is therefore regarded as an impediment to change which blunts interest group pressure and fragments public opinion in the Canadian polity. Pal endeavours to confront this thesis of the conservative and retarding influence of federalism as raised most prominently by Banting and Simeon.

The specific question raised by Pal is the extent to which federalism impeded the introduction of unemployment insurance prior to its establishment as a programme of exclusive federal jurisdiction following the constitutional amendment and subsequent legislation in 1940. A strong case is made by Pal of the delaying effects of federalism up to this point. Drawing on the insights of James Struthers, Pal supports the view that the protracted deliberations over 'who should do what' as much as 'what should be done' were a strong impediment to the formulation of an unemployment insurance scheme for Canada. Pal is even more confident than Struthers in asserting that the constitution presented a real barrier to change rather than merely an excuse for federal and provincial inactivity. Consequently, federalism assumes an important place in Pal's explanations of the delays in the implementation of unemployment insurance. Without convincing evidence for either scenario, it remains open for speculation as to whether unemployment insurance might have been introduced much earlier if legitimating and facilitating federal powers had been available.

The unity of Pal's study derives from its focus on unemployment insurance and its analysis of this history from various theoretical perspectives. This yields many insights into the growth, structure and general development of Canadian unemployment insurance and scholars of Canadian public policy owe a measure of debt to Pal. Together with James Struthers' work, we now have a rich variety of case study material on the development of unemployment policy in Canada. This, of course, makes Australian readers ever more conscious of the gaps in their own literature in this field. As well as Pal's specific contribution to the study of unemployment policy, this book contains an important integration and development of public policy theory. How welcome it is to find policy studies which do more than simply narrate political events and the history of programmes and attempt to be analytical - our knowledge of the complex processes of policy formation can only benefit. Pal's strength in this regard is that he does not simply expound a theory but takes as his objective 'theory evaluation and comparison'. We are able to scrutinise and weigh the merits of a variety of causal assumptions regarding the development of modern public policy. Here, I feel, we can look forward to others building upon Pal's initial work.

Paul Chantrill
Griffith University